Private Equity, Corporate Governance and the Dynamics of Capital Market Regulation

editor

Justin O'Brien

Centre for Applied Philosophy and
Public Ethics, and Charles Sturt University, Australia

Published by

Imperial College Press
57 Shelton Street
Covent Garden
London WC2H 9HE

Distributed by

World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd.
5 Toh Tuck Link, Singapore 596224
USA office: 27 Warren Street, Suite 401-402, Hackensack, NJ 07601
UK office: 57 Shelton Street, Covent Garden, London WC2H 9HE

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Private equity, corporate governance and the dynamics of capital market regulation /
edited by Justin O'Brien.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN-13: 978-1-86094-847-3

ISBN-10: 1-86094-847-2

1. Corporate governance. 2. Private equity. 3. Capital market--Law and legislation.

I. O'Brien, Justin.

HD2741.P765 2007

332'.042--dc22

2007040767

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Copyright © 2007 by Imperial College Press

All rights reserved. This book, or parts thereof, may not be reproduced in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or any information storage and retrieval system now known or to be invented, without written permission from the Publisher.

For photocopying of material in this volume, please pay a copying fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. In this case permission to photocopy is not required from the publisher.

Printed in Singapore.

In Memory of Murray Edelman

This page intentionally left blank

Preface

As this book was going to press, the Federal Court of Australia handed down judgment in *Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Citigroup Global Markets Australia Pty Ltd*, one of the most significant cases involving the management of conflicts of interest within investment banking. The regulator claimed that Citigroup had engaged in unconscionable conduct by trading on its own account while performing corporate advisory services for Toll Holdings in its — eventually successful — bid for Patrick, itself one of the most important takeovers in the current boom. The Court dismissed the application, which was designed to clarify whether and to what extent investment banking owed specific fiduciary duties to its clients and, if so, whether these duties could be overridden through contract. Justice Jacobson ruled that the ‘law does not prevent an investment bank from contracting out of or modifying any fiduciary obligation.’¹

The ruling was a major setback for ASIC, which had hoped that its aggressive enforcement agenda would serve a wider demonstration purpose. ASIC had invested significant reputational capital in the litigation, only to be trumped by a literal interpretation of the law from a distinguished judge, who opined that the imposition of fiduciary responsibilities was ‘a matter for the legislature, not the courts.’² Judicial resolution does not, however, solve the underlying problems identified in the litigation and magnified by the global boom in private equity. The range and intractability of conflicts have deepened, as the dynamics of financial capitalism reconfigure, in profound manner, institutional

¹ NSD 651 (28 June 2006) [601].

² Ibid [602].

timeframes, conceptions of corporate duty, and the efficacy of the shareholder-dominated corporate governance paradigm, and throw into stark relief the roles and responsibilities of financial intermediaries.

The issues that this book address are truly global in nature and the solutions advocated are based on the need to transcend narrow technical legal frameworks, irrespective of whether a rules or principles approach to governance is privileged. The book would not have been possible without the generous support of the Australian Research Council's Governance Research Network and the United Kingdom's Economic and Social Research Council World Economy and Finance Program. I wish to thank the respective directors, Charles Sampford and John Drifill, for providing the financing to hold an international workshop at the Australian National University in March 2007, at which earlier versions of these chapters were presented and critiqued. On behalf of the authors, I would like to thank Stephen Bottomley, John Braithwaite, Tom Campbell, John Coffee, Arie Freiberg, Graeme Hodge, Keith Houghton, Ian Ramsay, Paul Redmond and Sally Wheeler for their erudition and support throughout this process. In particular I am grateful to Malcolm Rodgers, Executive Director of Regulation at ASIC, for giving the keynote address to the workshop. My colleagues at the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics provided exceptional logistical support and I thank Ian Sharpe and Andrew Long. I also want to record my appreciation to Michael Buckingham and Aparna Rao for their excellent research assistance.

The success of socio-legal research on financial regulation is predicated on access. Regulatory and practitioner sources in Australia, New York and London have been remarkably generous with their time. I wish to acknowledge my gratitude to the ESRC for funding my ongoing program of research (RES 156-22-0033). I also want to thank Seumas Miller and Ian Ramsay for making me feel so welcome professionally in Australia. To Darina, Elise, Jack and Justin, this book represents another investment of your time for which I am forever indebted.

Justin O'Brien
Canberra, July 2007

Contents

Preface.	vii
Contributors.	xi
Introduction: The Dynamics of Capital Market Governance <i>Justin O'Brien</i>	1
1. The Conceptual Underpinnings of Australian Securities Regulation <i>Malcolm Rodgers</i>	19
2. Evolving 'Rules of the Game' in Corporate Governance Reform <i>Jennifer Hill</i>	29
3. Overlapping Fields and Constructed Legalities: The Endogeneity of Law <i>Lauren B Edelman</i>	55
4. The Significance of Relative Autonomy in How Regulation of the Financial Services Sector Evolves <i>George Gilligan</i>	91
5. <i>ASIC v Citigroup</i> : Investment Banks, Conflicts of Interest, and Chinese Walls <i>Pamela F Hanrahan</i>	117
6. Enforcement of Capital Markets Regulation: The United Kingdom and Its International Markets <i>Iain MacNeil</i>	143

7. Why Auditors Don’t Find Fraud
Nicholas M Hodson 179

8. Compliance, Ethics and Responsibility: Emergent Governance
Strategies in the US and UK
Doreen McBarnet 213

9. Professional Norms
Dean Cocking 241

10. *Sarbanes-Oxley* and the Search for Accountable Corporate
Governance
Melvin J Dubnick. 265

11. Charting an Icarian Flightpath: The Implications of the Qantas
Deal Collapse
Justin O’Brien 295

12. Institutions, Integrity Systems and Market Actors
Seumas Miller 339

Bibliography 371

Contributors

Dr Dean Cocking is a Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (an Australian Research Council-funded Special Research Centre).

Melvin J Dubnick is Professor of Political Science at the University of New Hampshire, USA.

Lauren B Edelman is Agnes Roddy Robb Professor of Law and Director, Center for the Study of Law and Society, at the School of Law, University of California, Berkeley, USA.

Dr George Gilligan is a Senior Research Fellow with the Department of Business Law & Taxation, Monash University, Australia.

Pamela F Hanrahan is Associate Professor of Law, Melbourne Law School and Deputy Director of the Centre for Corporate Law and Securities Regulation, University of Melbourne, Australia.

Jennifer Hill is Professor of Corporate Law at the University of Sydney Law School, and Visiting Professor at Vanderbilt University School of Law, USA.

Nicholas M Hodson CA, CA•IFA was a partner at Ernst & Young and led its Canadian Investigative and Dispute Services until 2005.

Iain MacNeil is Alexander Stone Professor of Commercial Law at the University of Glasgow, UK.

Doreen McBarnet is a Professor at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies at the University of Oxford, UK.

Seumas Miller is Professor of Philosophy at the Australian National University and Charles Sturt University (joint position), and Director of CAPPE.

Justin O'Brien is Professor of Corporate Governance at CAPPE and the Faculty of Business, Charles Sturt University. He is also Honorary Professor at the School of Law, Queen's University, Belfast.

Malcolm Rodgers is Executive Director, Regulation at the Australian Securities and Investments Commission. The opinions expressed in this chapter are the author's alone and do not necessarily reflect those of ASIC or its individual Commissioners.